The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

Mario Bisiada

23rd DiscourseNet conference
Università degli Studi di Bergamo

6–8 June 2019
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

Introduction

Examples

Alexis Tsipras's homework has been thrown back in his face

Larry Elliott

Judging by the angry red amendments all over Greece's proposals, its creditors are in no mood whatsoever to compromise

Alexis Tsipras, Greece's prime minister, at the talks in Brussels. Photograph: Julien Warnand/AFP/Getty Images
Puigdemont reta a Pedro Sánchez a que haga los “deberes pendientes en vacaciones”

“No se puede querer los votos para convertirse en presidente y luego no actuar en consecuencia”, ha recalcado el ex presidente desde Bruselas junto a Torra

Publicado el 28 de Julio de 2018 - 12:06
EL INDEPENDIENTE
Puigdemont reta a Pedro Sánchez a que haga los “deberes pendientes en vacaciones”

"No se puede querer los votos para convertirse en presidente y luego no actuar en consecuencia", ha recalcado el ex presidente desde Bruselas junto a Torra

Publicado el 28 de Julio de 2018 - 12:06
EL INDEPENDIENTE

Verónica Pérez afirma que “Susana Díaz le ha hecho los deberes a Rajoy con propuestas concretas”

16 de Diciembre de 2014 18:24h
Quali Paesi Ue hanno fatto i compiti a casa
Commissione Ue: quali Paesi membri hanno seguito le direttive e quali no

29 aprile 2019 - Non tutti i Paesi dell’Unione Europea si preoccupano di mettere in pratica le raccomandazioni della Commissione. Ecco quali sono gli Stati che hanno fatto i compiti a casa e chi invece, è ben lontano dal raggiungere questo traguardo.
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

Introduction

Examples

“Die arabische Welt hat jahrhundertelang ihre Hausaufgaben nicht gemacht.”

(Focus Magazin, Nr 28/2015)

[‘The Arabic world hasn’t done its homework for centuries.’]
Lakoff & Johnson (1980): *Metaphors we live by*

**Diagram:**

- **PERCEIVE**
- **THINK**
- **ACT**

*Conceptual system* are based on
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

Introduction

Metaphors structure how we see the world

Lakoff & Johnson (1980): *Metaphors we live by*

Metaphors inform the Conceptual system, which in turn informs Perception, Thinking, and Acting.

- Perception
- Thinking
- Acting

Metaphors are based on the Conceptual system.
Lakoff & Johnson (1980): *Metaphors we live by*

Metaphors structure how we see the world and inform the conceptual system that underlies our perceptions, thinking, acting, and communicating. Lakoff and Johnson argue that metaphors are not just literary devices but fundamental to how we understand and interact with the world.
Introduction

Metaphors structure how we see the world

Lakoff & Johnson (1980): *Metaphors we live by*

Lakoff & Johnson (1980): Our conceptual system is metaphorical

- “The essence of metaphor is understanding and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another” (Lakoff & Johnson 1980: 5)
Lakoff & Johnson (1980): Our conceptual system is metaphorical

- “The essence of metaphor is understanding and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another” (Lakoff & Johnson 1980: 5)
- metaphors structure how we perceive, how we think, and what we do
Lakoff & Johnson (1980): Our conceptual system is metaphorical

- “The essence of metaphor is understanding and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another” (Lakoff & Johnson 1980: 5)
- metaphors structure how we perceive, how we think, and what we do
- new metaphors: not just naming, but structuring a situation ⇒ conceptualising the world (Dobrovol’skij & Piirainen 2005: 142)
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

“Homework” as a structural metaphor

Discourse effects of the “homework” metaphor

Lakoff & Johnson (1980): *Metaphors we live by*

---

**homework → “structural metaphor”** (Lakoff & Johnson 1980)

- “use one highly structured and clearly delineated concept to structure another” (Lakoff & Johnson 1980: 61)
- “*do your homework*” ← prepare for complex economic/political task
Discourse effects of the “homework” metaphor

Bernabeu García (2012): “Hacer los deberes” no es cosa para niños

“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el maestro—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al alumnado las pautas que deben cumplir.”

Use of the “homework” metaphor
Use of the “homework” metaphor

- establishes teacher–pupil relationship
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

“Homework” as a structural metaphor

Discourse effects of the “homework” metaphor

Bernabeu García (2012): “Hacer los deberes” no es cosa para niños

“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el maestro—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al alumnado las pautas que deben cumplir.”

- Use of the “homework” metaphor
  - establishes teacher–pupil relationship
  - actor setting the homework → authority
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

“*Homework*” as a structural metaphor

Discourse effects of the “*homework*” metaphor

---

**Bernabeu García (2012): “Hacer los deberes” no es cosa para niños**

“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el *maestro*—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al *alumnado* las pautas que deben cumplir.”

- Use of the “*homework*” metaphor
  - establishes teacher–pupil relationship
  - actor setting the homework → authority
  - actor having to do the homework → inferiority
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

“Homework” as a structural metaphor

Discourse effects of the “homework” metaphor

Bernabéu García (2012): “Hacer los deberes” no es cosa para niños

“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el maestro—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al alumnado las pautas que deben cumplir.”

Use of the “homework” metaphor

- establishes teacher–pupil relationship
- actor setting the homework → authority
- actor having to do the homework → inferiority

Effects:

- helps fortify social and economic views (Holmgreen 2003)
- persuades others about how to see the world (Schiappa 2003)
- more effective than insults (e.g. “Pleite-Griechen” ['broke-greeks'] (Markwardt 2015))
“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el maestro—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al alumnado las pautas que deben cumplir.”

- Use of the “homework” metaphor
  - establishes teacher–pupil relationship
  - actor setting the homework → authority
  - actor having to do the homework → inferiority

- Effects:
  - helps fortify social and economic views (Holmgreen 2003)
Bernabéu García (2012): “Hacer los deberes” no es cosa para niños

“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el maestro—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al alumnado las pautas que deben cumplir.”

- Use of the “homework” metaphor
  - establishes teacher–pupil relationship
  - actor setting the homework → authority
  - actor having to do the homework → inferiority

- Effects:
  - helps fortify social and economic views (Holmgreen 2003)
  - persuades others about how to see the world (Schiappa 2003)
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

“Homework” as a structural metaphor

Discourse effects of the “homework” metaphor

Bernabeu García (2012): “Hacer los deberes” no es cosa para niños

“El motivo que justifica tal elección es la existencia de una autoridad—el maestro—que desde su postura jerárquicamente superior posee no solo la posibilidad, sino, más bien, la obligación de marcar al alumnado las pautas que deben cumplir.”

- Use of the “homework” metaphor
  - establishes teacher–pupil relationship
  - actor setting the homework → authority
  - actor having to do the homework → inferiority

- Effects:
  - helps fortify social and economic views (Holmgreen 2003)
  - persuades others about how to see the world (Schiappa 2003)
  - more effective than insults (e.g. “Pleite-Griechen” [‘broke-greeks’] (Markwardt 2015))
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

- “Homework” as a structural metaphor
- Shaping world views directly and indirectly

@MBisiada
„Die Formel ‚Zeit ist Geld‘ stimmt ganz besonders in Griechenland. […] **Die Griechen müssen ihre Hausaufgaben machen.** Athen profitiert von Milliardenhilfen über die Rettungspakete. Die Griechen haben keinen Grund zur Klage.“

– Volker Kauder, CDU government spokesman

['The formula “time is money” is especially true for Greece. […] **The Greeks must do their homework.** Athens is benefitting from billions via the aid packages. The Greeks have no reason to complain.‘]

Source: cducsu.de/presse/texte-und-interviews/griechen-muessen-ihrer-hausaufgaben-machen
Deberes tenemos todos

Los políticos europeos deben entender que hacer deberes no sólo es algo que atañe a la periferia

“Es hora de que algunos dirigentes europeos piensen que hacer los deberes no sólo es algo que atañe a los países del sur, sino a todos.”

(El País, 12 October 2014)
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

“Homework” as a structural metaphor

The “homework” metaphor in positive self-representation

The “homework” metaphor is used for:

- negative other-representation ✓
- positive self-representation (see Wodak 2001: 73)
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

—“Homework” as a structural metaphor
—The “homework” metaphor in positive self-representation

Thomas de Maizière
German minister of the Interior

“Das Zuwanderungsrecht hat seine Hausaufgaben gemacht.”

(Die Zeit, 24 August 2010)

[‘The immigration law has done its homework.’]
Summary so far

Effects of the “homework” metaphor

- simplification: the public believes problems are caused only by lazy and unattentive students (see Süßmuth 1997)

- influence public perception: particular interpretation is presented as natural, unchallengeable (Deignan 2005: 130)
Study overview

1 Corpora

DE  DWDS-ZEIT (1946–2017)
Study overview

1 Corpora

DE  DWDS-ZEIT (1946–2017)

2 Aims of the study

- to investigate the metaphoric use of the “homework” metaphor in English and German (quantitative)
- evaluative function – differentiate positive, negative and neutral contexts (qualitative)
- pedagogic metaphors in discourse on solutions to the crisis
“Homework” in English

First metaphoric occurrence: 6 July 1948

“The hon: Member for East Aberdeen, who had some considerable fun about having done his homework, wanted to know whether we are to be ‘trust busters’ under this Agreement: If he had really done his homework in reading the Agreement, or, alternatively, listened to the Chancellor of the Exchequer, I do not think he would have asked that question”
“Hausaufgaben” in German

First metaphoric occurrence

“Außerdem schwelt immer noch die Kontroverse um den dampfgekühlten Brüter, über den im Dezember des vergangenen Jahres eine abschließende Studie vorgelegt werden sollte, die dann noch einmal hätte diskutiert werden können. Diese Hausaufgabe freilich konnte das Karlsruher Management nicht erledigen.”

(Die Zeit, 26.02.1971)

[‘Furthermore there is still the controversy about […] This homework, of course, could not be done by the management in Karlsruhe.’]
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

Analysis

“Hausaufgaben” in German

The metaphor in the three corpora

![Graph showing occurrences of metaphor over decades for ZEIT, HANSARD, and COCA/COHA.](image-url)
Cross-linguistic studies of metaphor in discourse

“Nature”, “health” and “organism” established as source domains for metaphors → “education” has so far not received any attention.

Discourse on solutions: pedagogic metaphors?

“Bereits seit Mai 2014, früher als geplant, kann sich Lissabon wieder aus eigener Kraft finanzieren. In Brüssel und Berlin gelten die Portugiesen deshalb als Musterschüler, zusammen mit Irland.”

( Die Zeit, Nr 41/2015)

[‘Since May 2014 already, earlier than planned, Lissabon can finance itself autonomously. That’s why in Brussels and Berlin the Portuguese, along with Ireland, are seen as model pupils.’]
Discourse on solutions: pedagogic metaphors?

“Antes de la crisis, España era el alumno modelo de la clase de Maastricht, con un superávit público del 2,2% y un endeudamiento por debajo del 40% del PIB.”

(Nuevatribuna.es, 7 January 2012)

[‘Before the crisis, Spain was the model pupil of the Maastricht class, with a public surplus of 2.2% and a debt of less than 40% of GDP.’]
Conclusions

- metaphor seems to have spread from English to German
Conclusions

- metaphor seems to have spread from English to German
- non-evaluative profile (neutral) increasing: adoption of metaphor into general usage
Conclusions

- metaphor seems to have spread from English to German
- non-evaluative profile (neutral) increasing: adoption of metaphor into general usage
- negative effect on public debate, given the implications discussed
Conclusions

- metaphor seems to have spread from English to German
- non-evaluative profile (neutral) increasing: adoption of metaphor into general usage
  - negative effect on public debate, given the implications discussed
  - causes of crises unavoidable ("nature"), but solutions (or lack thereof) human error?
The “education” frame as a means to establish unequal power relations and manipulate debates

Conclusions & References

Conclusions

Thank you for your attention!

Article:
Bisiada, Mario. 2018.
A cross-linguistic analysis of the “homework” metaphor in German and English political discourse. 
doi:10.1177/0957926518802916
References I


[http://ponss.blogs.uv.es/2012/05/15/hacer-los-deberes-no-es-cosa-de-ninos/](http://ponss.blogs.uv.es/2012/05/15/hacer-los-deberes-no-es-cosa-de-ninos/).


References II


